

13. RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are aimed at local and national policymakers, Muslim communities and civil-society organisations. They reflect key findings from the report and address the need for further engagement by Hamburg City Council with its myriad and growing communities. At the same time, responsibility lies with communities to initiate actions and efforts which bring about change in policy, practice and behaviour. While recognising that Hamburg offers a number of very positive practices on inclusion of its diverse communities, the report calls for policies to tackle socio-economic disadvantage and minority inclusion, so as to ensure that all groups that make up the diverse population of the city are consulted and that their specific needs are understood and accommodated.

13.1 Education

13.1.1 Muslim and migrant parents

1. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for School and Vocational Training, Chamber of Parents (*Elternkammer*) and independent parents' associations should continue, extend and permanently establish innovative projects in working with Muslim and migrant parents, such as the parents café in Wilhelmsburg, which combines an informal social gathering with information about the education system.⁵¹⁷ The associations carrying out the work with parents should be truly independent. Barriers in seeking a greater participation from migrant and Muslim parents, such as the official and very formal procedures when forming parent committees, should be explored by the Department for School and Vocational Training.
2. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for School and Vocational Training and other local initiatives should support schools in opening up to the local Muslim and migrant communities in the upcoming regional education conferences (*Bildungskonferenzen*) starting in 2010 to better develop the new local area schools (*Stadtteilschulen*) as open learning spaces and places of interaction for all. Active Muslim and migrant teachers and parents should be supported as mediators with the local Muslim and migrant communities.

13.1.2 Evidence-based research and intercultural training

3. The Senate of Hamburg and the Department for School and Vocational Training should ensure that issues related to religious and cultural stereotyping

⁵¹⁷ See the website of the Gymnasium Kirchdof/Wilhelmsburg at <http://www.kiwi.hamburg.de/index.php/article/detail/2391> (accessed January 2010).

and discrimination are addressed as part of existing language support and teacher training.

4. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Institute for Teacher Education and School Development (LI) should consider a review of existing compulsory modules on cultural diversity in schools to ensure that all training includes basic knowledge about the AGG of 2006 focused on the effects of religious and cultural discrimination.
5. The Senate of Hamburg and the Department for School and Vocational Training should commission research studies on Hamburg's Muslim and migrant communities, their influences and preferences on educational decisions and the choice of schools for pupils that seek to obtain a better understanding of the influences of diverse ethnic backgrounds, language competencies and level of qualifications for transition into the labour market. The studies should explore and identify initiatives currently practised in schools in Hamburg and other cities in Germany with a view to offering them as best practices in an effort to challenge cultural and religious prejudice. The results of such studies should be encouraged to become part of teaching practices.

13.1.3 Diversity in schooling

6. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the relevant actors, such as the Department for School and Vocational Training, the Central Office for Integration and Civil Society, the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt) and the human resources department are encouraged to take the lead in developing a strategic diversity plan in the educational sector in Hamburg, with the objective of increasing the personnel with Muslim and migrant backgrounds in day-care facilities, kindergartens, pre-schools, schools, universities and adult education, according to their percentage in the population.

13.1.4 Monitoring the intercultural expansion of the education sector

7. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for School and Vocational Training should monitor the effects of the change from a three-strand to a two-strand educational system, currently implemented, with a particular view of the number of students in the classes and of the progress of students and teachers, and towards determining if the investments made in the educational system affect the teachers' working time model.

13.2 Employment

13.2.1 Local alliance for employment of Muslims and migrants

8. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with business enterprises in Hamburg, including trade unions, the labour agencies (*Agentur für Arbeit*, *Jobcenter*, *team.arbeit.hamburg*), the chambers (*Handelskammer*, *Handwerkskammer*), associations of entrepreneurs, departments (*Behörden*), representatives of Muslim NGOs, migrant enterprises and other relevant actors, such as the district assemblies (*Bezirksversammlungen*), should initiate local alliances for employment (*lokale Beschäftigungsbündnisse*) with the objective of increasing the employment of Muslim and migrant workers. This should include: a revision of recruitment procedures; public awareness-raising; the development of clear and transparent criteria for a public award scheme for public- and private-sector organisations that have instigated positive minority representation in their workforce; training; and regulations on quotas of employees in the public services and in private enterprises.

13.2.2 Monitoring the effects of the local alliance for employment

9. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the other actors of the local alliance for employment should establish a body which monitors and evaluates the effects of the objectives developed by the local alliance for employment, with a view to increasing Muslim and migrant economic integration. This should include, among other things: the monitoring of recruitment procedures; the criteria for the public award scheme; the quotas of employees in the public services and in private enterprises; and the monitoring of non-discriminatory procedures for the award of public works contracts, public supply contracts and public service contracts (EU directives 2004-18-EG, 2004-17-EG).

13.2.3 Qualifying training for employed and unemployed Muslims and migrants

10. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Federal Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs (*Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales*), the labour agencies (*Bundesagentur für Arbeit*, *Jobcenter*, *team.arbeit.hamburg*), employers and trade unions should provide qualifying training on the job for employees, which meets the needs of Muslim and migrant workers.

13.2.4 Strengthening the migrant economy

11. The Hamburg Senate and relevant actors such as the Department for Urban Planning and Environment, the Department for the Management of Social

Space and the Management of Transition (*Sozialraummanagement, Übergangsmanagement*) in the Office for the Hamburg-Mitte District should strengthen the migrant economy (migrants as employers and those who provide training on the job) at the local and national level through providing credits and supporting local socio-spatial measures in urban planning.

13.2.5 Recognition of school-leaving certificates, professional qualifications and academic titles earned outside Germany

12. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Federal Ministry for Labour and Social Affairs (*Bundesministerium für Arbeit und Soziales*), the Commission on Federal and Länder Affairs (*Bund-Länder-Kommission*), the chambers (*Handelskammer, Handwerkskammer*), the Hamburg Department for Economy and Labour, the Department for School and Vocational Training, the advisory board on integration and all other relevant bodies should review existing lists of recognised school-leaving certificates, professional qualifications and academic titles earned outside Germany and establish transparent criteria and easy procedures for their recognition, which are accepted by employers.

13.3 Housing

13.3.1 Roundtable on housing for Muslims and migrants

13. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for Urban Planning and Environment (*Behörde für Stadtentwicklung und Umwelt*), the Anti-discrimination Body (*Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt*) should encourage better coordination between housing companies and diverse Muslim representative organisations (e.g. the SCHURA) in Hamburg that will improve relations between housing companies and Muslim tenants and offer a forum to discuss opportunities and limitations in social housing schemes. A complaint mechanism for housing questions should be established.

13.3.2 Monitoring the effects of redevelopment programmes on Muslim and migrant populations

14. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for Urban Planning and Environment, the Department for the Management of Social Space and the Management of Transition (*Sozialraummanagement, Übergangsmanagement*) in the Office for the Hamburg-Mitte District and possible other actors should evaluate the effects of regeneration and redevelopment programmes on the distribution of the Muslim population in the city and should find ways to minimise the negative effects of those programmes for Muslim and migrant communities.

13.3.3 Representation of Muslims and migrants in the urban planning process

15. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for Urban Planning and Environment, the Department for the Management of Social Space and the Management of Transition and other relevant actors are encouraged to foster dialogue with local mosques and Muslim communities to increase the participation of Muslim representatives in urban planning processes. Such dialogue could also contribute to the need for a demographic balance in the number of Muslim residents remaining in the centre of the city and those who are moving to the outskirts of the city due to rising rent prices.

13.4 Health and Social Services

13.4.1 Equal access to the health-care system

16. The Senate of Hamburg and the Department for Social, Family, Public Health and Consumer Protection and other responsible institutions should enforce the existing legal framework (§ 88 Abs. 2 AufenthG [related to doctors, protecting the relationship to the patient], § 203 StGB [legal requirement concerning confidential medical communication], §§ 223, 13 and § 323c StGB [malicious injury through medical treatment, failure to assist a person in danger])⁵¹⁸ for people without residence permits and review the scope of health care offered to people without residence permits, with a view to improving the level of and access to adequate health-care services.

13.4.2 Ethno-medical training and intercultural mediators

17. The Senate of Hamburg, the Department for Social, Family, Public Health and Consumer Protection, the Association for Doctors in the Health Systems (*Kassenärztliche Vereinigung*) and other relevant actors should provide training on ethno-medical approaches for practitioners working in areas with a high population of migrants and Muslims.
18. Practitioners and hospitals should be encouraged by the Senate of Hamburg and other actors to actively seek existing training projects or initiatives on

⁵¹⁸ Katholisches Forum, “Leben in der Illegalität”: Stellungnahme zum Bericht des Bundesministeriums des Innern zum Prüfauftrag “Illegalität” (Catholic Forum, “Living in Illegality”, position paper on the report of the Federal Ministry of the Interior on the “illegality” audit) aus der Koalitionsvereinbarung vom 11 November 2005 (from coalition treaty 11 November 2005), Kapitel VIII 1.2 Illegal aufhältige Migranten in Deutschland – Datenlage, Rechtslage, Handlungsoptionen (Chapter VIII 1.2 Illegally residing immigrants in Germany – Data availability, rights, options for action), February 2007, available at <http://www.forum-illegalitaet.de/StellungnahmeBMI-Bericht-Forum.pdf> (accessed January 2010).

health affairs conducted by Muslim communities and then integrate them with their regular funding.

19. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for Social, Family, Public Health and Consumer Protection should encourage all hospital managements in Hamburg to recruit specific intercultural mediators in the provision of culturally-sensitive health care, especially for Muslim and ethnic-minority patients in hospitals and homes for elderly people. One such good practice is the University Hospital Eppendorf (UKE).

13.4.3 Diversity in local health centres

20. The Senate of Hamburg, the Department for Social, Family, Public Health and Consumer Protection, the Department for the Management of Social Space and the Management of Transition and other relevant actors in the districts should identify good examples in health-care provision, such as the health centre in St Pauli, which is seen to be successfully offering appropriate health service delivery for the local population. Such models can be disseminated and established in other areas with particular emphasis on recruiting qualified multilingual practitioners with Muslim and other culturally diverse backgrounds.

13.4.4 Monitoring effects of health reforms on Muslim and migrant populations

21. The Senate of Hamburg, the Department for Social, Family, Public Health and Consumer Protection and other relevant actors should monitor the effects of the recent reforms in the Federal health-care systems on the socio-economically disadvantaged population in Hamburg-Mitte, including specific groups like Muslims and migrants, in order to determine the impact of the reforms on service delivery, especially psycho-social services in the mother tongue.

13.5 Policing

13.5.1 Data collection

22. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department of the Interior in Hamburg, the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt), the Ombudsman for data protection and specialised NGOs should consider, on the basis of the recommendation of the German Institute for Human Rights,

collecting data on minority groups, specifically Muslim, in order to understand the level of trust and concerns about the criminal justice system.⁵¹⁹

13.5.2 Diversity in policing

23. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department of the Interior in Hamburg should explore opportunities to facilitate an increase in multilingual officers in the police force and identify barriers hampering the access of Muslims and migrants into the police force. To facilitate this process an exchange of best practices with police forces from other EU countries is encouraged.
24. The Senate of Hamburg and the Department of the Interior should explore opportunities for providing more well-trained multilingual visible neighbourhood police officers (BUNABE) in areas with a high proportion of Muslim and migrant residents. Multi-ethnic and religious officers are encouraged to be part of BUNABE.

13.5.3 Introducing compulsory intercultural police training

25. The Hamburg Senate in cooperation with police training institutions should consider including compulsory intercultural training modules which offer linguistic, cultural and religious traditions of minority communities in Hamburg as part of the curriculum of the police academy, in order to build good community relations and provide effective policing.

13.5.4 Monitoring through an independent police complaints commission

26. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department of the Interior and the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt) should establish an independent police complaints commission, as suggested by Amnesty International, with a general complaints procedure and an ombudsman within the police force, to deal with complaints and to monitor the improvement of the services of the police.⁵²⁰

⁵¹⁹ Protokoll: Fachgespräch des Deutschen Instituts für Menschenrechte. Datenerhebung zum Erweis ethnischer Diskriminierung (Minutes: expert meeting at the German Institute for Human Rights. Data collection for a demonstration of ethnic discrimination), 12 June 2008, typescript.

⁵²⁰ Amnesty International, “Amnesty International fordert die Stelle eines Polizeibeauftragten” (Amnesty International calls for an ombudsperson for the police), available at <http://www.ai-hamburg.de/images/stories/pressemitteilungen/presseerklaerung%20polizeigewalt-hamburg.pdf> (accessed January 2010).

13.5.5 Coordination mechanisms

27. The Senate of Hamburg is encouraged to include the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt) in the inter-administrative steering group that meets to discuss local policing issues.

13.6 Media

13.6.1 Multi-citizen forums

28. The Hamburg Senate, Muslim and migrant representative organisations, media representatives and advertising companies should establish a regular forum to discuss topics such as diversity and anti-discrimination in order to place them on the political agenda and to monitor their effects on the media. Public and private media sectors could develop an award scheme that rewards organisations for balanced media coverage.

13.6.2 Training for Muslim and migrant NGOs

29. This forum should initiate the joint training of journalists, Muslim and migrant NGOs, with a focus on professional media work (PR management) and writing a handbook on language sensibility.

13.6.3 Monitoring diversity

30. The Hamburg Senate should support publishing houses, media enterprises and the *Landesmedienanstalt* of Hamburg and Schleswig-Holstein to agree on steps to support young Muslim and migrant journalists, to achieve and guarantee an appropriate presentation of Muslims and migrants at all levels of the media infrastructure. This should be monitored by the independent monitoring body established by the media forum.

13.7 Muslim and migrant organisations

13.7.1 Action against discrimination

31. Muslim and migrant organisations should take steps towards stronger engagement against discrimination and building better networks with local politics and the respective NGOs in order to address this issue. Mosques and community centres that offer social counselling should consider training counsellors and social workers on how to recognise and deal with discrimination, including basic knowledge about the context in which the AGG operates.
32. The SCHURA and other migrant organisations in cooperation with the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt) and the Department for School

and Vocational Training are encouraged to develop a curriculum on how human rights-based approaches to equal treatment can be implemented in schools, universities, institutions of adult education, mosques and organisations.

13.7.2 Improving networking

33. The representatives of active local Muslim and migrant organisations should encourage other Muslim or migrant organisations not yet active in the field to improve their networking with respective NGOs of different backgrounds, especially concerning young people, education and anti-discrimination.
34. Muslim and minority organisations should take steps to encourage residents towards heightened engagement in district and city politics in order to get better participation in decision-making and networking.

13.7.3 Addressing the general public

35. Muslim and migrant organisations should make information events such as the open mosque days more public. Muslim organisations should consider opening up the mosque as a general community and information centre for the local neighbourhood.
36. Muslim organisations in Hamburg should consider joint declarations on the basis of a human rights approach on contested social and political issues, following the example of a declaration by seven Muslim organisations in Berlin on Islamophobia and homophobia. Those declarations should be communicated throughout the city and beyond, and particularly in the Muslim communities.

13.8 District administration

13.8.1 Preventing and tackling discrimination

37. The Department for the Management of Social Space and the Management of Transition (*Sozialraummanagement, Übergangsmanagement*) in the Office for the Hamburg-Mitte District, in cooperation with the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt) and other actors, should ensure that anti-discrimination counselling by independent NGOs is provided in local neighbourhood centres. Testing squads could be established and trained to test the district's public and private services so as to make the actual level of discrimination in the city visible.

13.8.2 Local mentoring programmes

38. The Department for the Management of Social Space and the Management of Transition in the Office for the Hamburg-Mitte District, in cooperation with other actors, should create and support more mentoring programmes for youths of migrant backgrounds, in order to foster greater participation in society by identifying specific role models as mentors and mediators. This could include local campaigns celebrating the diversity of Hamburg-Mitte, pointing out the advantages of a diversity of communities, that bring together people from Muslim and non-Muslim backgrounds as well as residents with various national and social origins and stand as an example of fruitful cohabitation.

13.8.3 Mainstreaming Muslims

39. The Department for the Management of Social Space and the Management of Transition in the Office for the Hamburg-Mitte District, in cooperation with other actors, should mainstream Muslims' views so as to incorporate them in district planning and projects – with an emphasis on youth projects – by acknowledging and building on their specific access to the whole Muslim community; working with community groups and organisations including imams and other religious leaders in, for example, anti-violence and drug programmes or HIV/AIDS prevention. Existing commercial and non-commercial services for young people should be reviewed, with the objective of improvement and to explore opportunities for young Muslims to organise sports and youth associations free of charge

13.9 Senate and Citizenry

13.9.1 Tackling discrimination in Hamburg

40. The Hamburg Citizenry is encouraged to make an all-party declaration of their purpose to create an environment free of discrimination for the whole population of Hamburg. To support this, the Hamburg Senate and the Citizenry are encouraged to become members of the X Coalition, “Cities against Racism”. The Hamburg Senate and the individual Senators as well as the First Mayor of Hamburg should recognise the importance of symbolic actions and statements on inclusion and take up opportunities for making them. This includes raising awareness about anti-discrimination laws, accompanied by support (including access to legal advice) for those seeking redress against religious discrimination.
41. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Department for Social, Family, Public Health, and Consumer Protection together with the Hamburg Department of Justice should link all relevant administrative bodies responsible for the implementation of integration policies and the fight against

discrimination in all forms, including the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt), which should be provided with sufficient human and financial resources and other support by the Senate of Hamburg for creating a central unit where cases of anti Muslim and anti-migrant discrimination are gathered and documented. The anti-discrimination body at the Federal level should consider integrating this into their existing research and publications.

42. The Senate of Hamburg in cooperation with the Justice Administration of Hamburg, the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt) and other relevant actors should establish transparent and accessible complaint procedures and qualitative indicators for a monitoring system. Special focus should be placed on multiple discrimination faced by distinct ethnic and religious groups. More funds could be provided to civil society groups with the expertise in combating such issues.

13.9.2 From policing to social justice and participation

43. The Federal Government, in particular the Department of the Interior (*Innenbehörde*) and the Senate of Hamburg, should consider reform of the way information and decision-making in the police about Muslim communities are transmitted to the general public. Options for reform could include greater emphasis on inclusion and the taking of responsibility by the Department for Social, Family, Public Health and Consumer Protection and Policy units of different government departments.
44. Local funding authorities should ensure access to public funding for Muslim organisations and their respective social projects in order to profit from improved access to certain groups in society and to make better use of the skills and human resources of Muslim communities.

13.9.3 Research on religious and ethnic self-definitions

45. The steering committee of the HHAP, in conjunction with the anti-discrimination body (Arbeitsstelle Vielfalt), the Ombudsman for data protection and specialised NGOs should look into methods of gathering voluntary data on the diverse populations of Hamburg. Studies on a voluntary and anonymous basis should include religious and ethnic self-definitions. A general agreement among the different actors in Hamburg should be concluded on what kind of data should be collected.

13.10 National Politics

13.10.1 Reviewing and monitoring existing and new legislation

46. The Federal government in cooperation with other relevant ministries should develop a process for carrying out equality impact assessments⁵²¹ of new policy proposals to ensure that policies do not inadvertently and indirectly discriminate or disadvantage particular groups. Regulations that have the effect of excluding Muslim organisations from public funding as well as the barriers that are faced by German-born residents in gaining access to citizenship should be reviewed. The Federal government should also review the law on the relation between the state and the different religious institutions (*Staatskirchenrecht*), to ensure equal treatment of different religious affiliations that do not follow the same management structure as Christian churches.

13.10.2 Working with civil society

47. The Federal government in cooperation with the *Länder* should establish a pact against discrimination with civil society and start a process of evaluating the experience with the Federal anti-discrimination body, to increase its efficiency and independence, with particular attention to the comments of the European Commission and of NGOs.

⁵²¹ See <http://www.idea.gov.uk/idk/core/page.do?pageId=8017247> (accessed 14 March 2010).