

EMAIL Reply:

From: Pucci, Lauren E [PucciLE@state.gov]
Sent: Friday, May 27, 2005 4:57 PM
To: Ann Jordan; 'am808@columbia.edu';
'Julia.O'connelldavidson@nottingham.ac.uk'; 'audrey.maklin@utoronto.ca';
'jjacobson@genderhealth.org'; 'uhl@uni-leipzig.de';
'bridget.anderson@anthropology.oxford.ac.uk'; 'csv1@columbia.edu';
'sealing.cheng@gmail.com'
Subject: A message from Ambassador John Miller

Importance: High

Dear Ann, Alice, Julia, Audrey, Daerbel, Bridget, Carole and Sealing:

Thank you for your letter of April 21 that critiques the State Department's fact sheet *The Link Between Prostitution and Sex Trafficking*. I am glad you found the document interesting enough to warrant a close reading. Please note: This fact sheet is one in a series of documents on the varieties of human trafficking. Enclosed please find our most recent one on child sex tourism. Within the next month, we will release new fact sheets on forced labor, child soldier slavery, and camel jockey slavery. All documents produced by the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons are available at our Web site: www.state.gov/g/tip <<http://www.state.gov/g/tip>>.

I applaud your commitment to eradicating the conditions that put women, men, and children at risk of trafficking in persons (TIP). The magnitude of this global crime requires that all organizations dedicated to human rights, justice, and the rule of law join forces in this effort.

While I suspect we agree on many of the causes of trafficking in persons (i.e. attitudes toward gender, poverty, organized crime, and corruption, among other causes), it is clear that we disagree on the link between prostitution and sex trafficking. It is obvious to us, as stated in the fact sheet, that prostitution "fuels" the increase in sex trafficking. Where prostitution thrives, so does sex trafficking! It is because of this belief that the President issued National Security Presidential Directive 22, which is explicit regarding the link between legalized prostitution and human trafficking. The directive states:

The United States Government opposes prostitution and any related activities, including pimping, pandering, or maintaining brothels, as contributing to the phenomenon of trafficking in persons. These activities are inherently harmful and dehumanizing. The United States Government position is that these activities should not be regulated as a legitimate form of work for any human being.

The U.S. Congress underscored the understanding that legalized prostitution contributes to human trafficking in the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act of 2003.

With regard to your questions, I hereby offer responses where I can be helpful.

The source of the fact sheet's estimate that 80 percent of TIP victims are female and up to 50 percent are minors is a U.S. Government report from April 2004. The estimates are not surprising considering that sex slavery and domestic servitude slavery are two of the biggest categories of modern-day slavery, and women and girls make up the overwhelming majority of victims in these two categories. I have enclosed a copy of this report, which includes a discussion of methodology. We agree that any estimate in this area is difficult because victims do not stand on line and raise their hands to be counted. Nonetheless, we believe that this estimate correctly points out how a disproportionate burden of modern-day slavery falls on women and children.

The paper by Gunilla Ekberg footnoted in the fact sheet details Sweden's response to prostitution and trafficking in persons, and the positive impact of decriminalizing the conduct of women engaged in prostitution while criminalizing the conduct of traffickers, sex buyers, and brothel owners. We consider the Swedish approach intriguing and worthy of close review. You may read Ms. Ekberg's paper on the Internet (although it is a little complicated to get there):

Go to the following link: <<http://www.aqoci.qc.ca/cqfd/trafic.html>>
Click on: Partie 2 : stratégies <<http://www.aqoci.qc.ca/cqfd/doctrafic/partie2.pdf>>
Page 11, Gunilla Ekberg, Le Cas de Suède (statistic on p. 16 of the PDF)

Regarding countries placed on Tier 1 in the annual TIP Report that you refer to as having legalized prostitution (i.e. The Netherlands and Germany), the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 requires tier ratings to emphasize government efforts against human trafficking (especially in terms of prosecution, protection, and prevention) rather than the extent of the TIP problem. Both of these countries have substantial anti-TIP efforts underway that, in the view of the U.S. Government, justify Tier 1 ratings.

However, I can assure you, based on personal visits and talks with hundreds of officials and NGOs, that sex trafficking has grown significantly over the last decade in both The Netherlands and Germany. There are many causes for this, and many excuses, but one of the chief causes is the growth and promotion of the sex trade, including prostitution, particularly in The Netherlands.

Regarding the photograph of Moldovan and Romanian women, the source of this image is Associated Press. According to the Department of State's public affairs office, AP routinely obtains consent from people depicted in photographs before releasing the pictures for use.

I agree with you that good research will contribute to more effective interventions to prevent and respond to trafficking. I hope you will share with me the research you generate and come across in your anti-TIP activities. Please be assured I will read the reports you referenced in your letter with great interest.

However, it appears to me that your caution risks ignoring the very real, horrifying plight of people being used and abused in prostitution today-and it would be illegal, as well as unethical, to wait for the conclusion of more studies before we address their plight. In the meantime, we find the study by eight clinicians in the Journal of Trauma Practice (Vol. 2, No.

3/4, 2003. pp. 33-74) to be very persuasive about the toll and trauma, involving rape and harassment, suffered by most women used in prostitution.

Human trafficking is estimated by the Federal Bureau of Investigations to be a \$9.5 billion business annually. Sex trafficking is considered the most lucrative category of human trafficking. Pimps can make between \$15,000 and \$20,000 per month off one woman's body. These astronomical profits are legitimized by legalized and regulated prostitution-but the human costs are too often repulsive.

As you are aware, the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons is in the process of producing the 2005 TIP Report. Over the last few months, organizations from around the world have sent us victim stories. We fact checked the accounts through U.S. embassies worldwide for veracity, only changing the names of the victims. I share a few of these accounts with you in order to demonstrate the despicable nature of the sex trafficking crime-and to demonstrate that what motivates traffickers is the money to be made in prostitution.

Cambodia

Neary grew up in rural Cambodia. Her parents died when she was a child, and, her sister married her off when she was 17. Three months later, the newlyweds went to visit a fishing village. Her husband rented a room in what Neary thought was a guesthouse. But when she woke the next morning, her husband was gone. The owner of the house told her she had been sold by her husband for \$300 and that she was actually in a brothel. For five years, Neary was raped by five to seven men every day. In addition to brutal physical abuse, Neary was infected with HIV and contracted AIDS. The brothel threw her out when she became sick, and she eventually found her way to a local shelter. She died of HIV/AIDS at the age of 23.

Italy

Viola, a young Albanian, was 13 when she started dating 21-year-old Dilin, who proposed to marry her, then move with her to Italy where he had cousins who could get him a job. Arriving in Italy, Viola's life changed forever.

Dilin locked her in a hotel room and left her, never to be seen again. A group of men entered and beat Viola. Then, each raped her. The leader informed Viola that Dilin had sold her and that she had to obey him or else she would be killed. For seven days Viola was beaten and repeatedly raped.

Viola was sold a second time to someone who beat her head so badly she was unable to see for two days. She was told if she didn't work as a prostitute, her mother and sister in Albania would be raped and killed. Viola was forced to submit to prostitution until police raided the brothel she was in. She was deported to Albania.

Singapore

Karin, a young mother of two, was looking for a job in Sri Lanka when a man befriended her and convinced her that she could land a better job in Singapore as a waitress. He arranged and paid for her travel. A Sri Lankan woman met Karin upon arrival in Singapore, confiscated her passport, and took her to a hotel. The woman made it clear that Karin had to submit to prostitution to pay back the money it cost for her to be flown into Singapore. Karin was taken to an open space for sale in the sex market where she joined women from Indonesia, Thailand,

India, and China to be inspected and purchased by men from Pakistan, India, China, Indonesia and Africa. The men would take the women to nearby hotels and rape them. Karin was forced to have sex with an average of 15 men a day or night. She developed a serious illness, and three months after her arrival was arrested by the Singaporean police during a raid on the brothel. She was deported to Sri Lanka.

Turkey

Svetlana was a young Belarusian living in Minsk and looking for a job when she came upon some Turkish men who promised her a well-paying job in Istanbul. Once Svetlana crossed the border, her passport and money were taken and she was locked up. Svetlana and another foreign woman were sent to the apartment of two businessmen and forced into prostitution. Svetlana had other plans: In an attempt to escape, she jumped out of a window and fell six stories to the street below. According to Turkish court documents, customers did not take Svetlana to the hospital, they called the traffickers instead, who strangled her to death. Svetlana's body lay unclaimed in the morgue for two weeks until Turkish authorities learned her identity and sent her body to Belarus. But Svetlana did not die in vain. Belarusian and Turkish authorities cooperated effectively to arrest and charge those responsible for contributing to a death and for human trafficking.

United Arab Emirates

Lusa is a 17 year-old orphan kidnapped in 2004 from her native Uzbekistan. Lusa's aunt engineered her abduction to Dubai using a cousin's passport, because the aunt wanted to take Lusa's apartment. In Dubai, Lusa was sold to a slavery and prostitution ring. When she was no longer useable in prostitution, the traffickers sent her to a psychiatric center. An Uzbek NGO located her in Dubai. The NGO arranged to move her to a shelter, and they began working on her repatriation. Because she entered the U.A.E. illegally, on a false passport, the U.A.E. immigration service said she should serve a two-year prison sentence. Government officials and the enterprising NGO are negotiating Lusa's case.

Uzbekistan

Uzbek student Mara was looking for a job to get her through college when she got an offer from a friendly businesswoman who assured Mara that she would personally mentor her in the business of importing clothes from Thailand.

But Mara was terribly deceived. Her respectable job in Bangkok turned ugly when the businesswoman disappeared; Mara and other young Uzbek women and girls were bussed to Kuala Lumpur where a Russian-speaking Chinese man imprisoned them in a hotel and forced them to provide sex to men. When one of the women in the hotel tried to escape, she was brutally beaten in front of Mara and others to serve as an example. Mara decided to keep quiet for two months rather than be beaten. But two months stretched into four. Mara was transported back in Thailand where she was bought, then dropped, by a Frenchman. Without money, suspicious of everyone, Mara finally made her way to the NGO Foundation for Woman in Bangkok, which helped reunite her with her family.

Ann, I meet these victims around the world. Neary died a few months after I met her in Cambodia. Meeting these women and girls has made me an abolitionist-determined to end the enslavement of people trapped in domestic servitude, trapped in farm and factory servitude, and

abused as child soldiers, as camel jockeys, as sex slaves. More research won't change the facts of gender-based violence that forms the core of prostitution and serves as a giant magnet for more victims.

I look forward to working with you and your colleagues as we seek to abolish modern-day slavery, and I thank you for your strong commitment to this cause.

Sincerely,

John Miller

Ambassador John Miller
Director, Office to Monitor and Combat
Trafficking in Persons